HISTORICAL INQUIRY QUESTION

How and why is Toypurina remembered differently by different groups of people?

LOST LA EPISODE

Borderlands
How and why is Toypurina remembered differently by different groups of people?

Content Standards
This lesson was created for Ethnic Studies and US History teachers. There are no content standards for 11th grade that address Toypurina and Spanish colonization of California.

CCSS Standards
CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.9: Integrate information from diverse sources, both primary and secondary, into a coherent understanding of an idea or event, noting discrepancies among sources.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.7: Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, as well as in words) in order to address a question or solve a problem.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.WHST.11-12.1.A: Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.SL.11-12.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 11-12 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.SL.11-12.2: Integrate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) in order to make informed decisions and solve problems, evaluating the credibility and accuracy of each source and noting any discrepancies among the data.
Lost LA Episode
The KCET episode “Borderlands” covers early California history, from the 18th to the 19th century. This episode offers a broad perspective on the history of the West and the Southwest, from indigenous peoples through early European encounters, up through U.S. expansionism and the Mexican-American War. Overall, this episode and lesson included are an examination of the intersection and collision between Native American, Spanish, Mexican, and American peoples and cultures. This lesson will focus on Toypurina, an indigenous woman who helped to lead a failed uprising at the Mission San Gabriel in Southern California in 1785. Students will be challenged to engage in the historical thinking skill of perspective-taking as they explore how different groups experienced the mission era and how Toypurina is remembered differently by different groups historically and up through the present.

Overview of Lesson
In this lesson, students will work with a variety of primary and secondary sources to critically examine how different groups throughout history and in present-day remember Toypurina, a Tongva indigenous woman, and her involvement in the failed rebellion at the Mission San Gabriel. Students will explore the complex interactions between indigenous and Spanish peoples during early California history and be challenged to consider how the legacy of this history is still present in our communities today.
This lesson is ideal for high school students in Ethnic Studies classes learning about California history or European colonization of North America. Background information for teachers or students on the topic can be found at the following sites:
KCET Untold History: The Survival of California’s Indians
KCET Toypurina: A Legend Etched in the Landscape of Los Angeles

Sources
A. Temple account of Toypurina
B. HOOD sisters mural
C. Danzas Indigenas by Judy Baca
D. Testimony of Toypurina
E. Hackle account of Toypurina

Procedures
Length: 2-3 class periods
1. Warm Up: Project the Toypurina mural from Ramona Gardens (Handout 1) and have students examine the mural up close on their handout. Have students consider these questions:
   a. What do you see? Who do you think the woman featured in the center might be?
   b. What makes you think this? What does she mean or represent to the community of Ramona Gardens?
   c. Why did the artist feature here in this mural?
Discuss as a class or have students engage in a quick-write for 4 minutes, encouraging them to write their "stream of consciousness" about their observations of the mural.

2. Tell students that the woman in the mural is Toypurina, an indigenous woman in California who participated in a revolt at the San Gabriel Mission in 1785. Introduce the historical inquiry question: **How and why is Toypurina remembered differently by different groups of people?**

3. Next, show the Lost LA “Borderlands” episode. It is recommended to show the entire episode, but it could be stopped around minute 15 if the teacher is pressed for time. Consider using the following questions to lead a small group or a whole-class discussion after viewing (Handout 2):
   a. What are some of the different ways the San Gabriel Mission is remembered by people today? How do the Tongva people view the mission?
   b. Who was Nicolas Jose? Why did he organize the rebellion against the priests?
   c. Why does Toypurina become remembered as the leader of the rebellion?
   d. After the rebellion, Toypurina gets baptized and marries a Spanish soldier. How does this change the way we might remember Toypurina?
   e. Who was Jose Maria Pico? How did he benefit from the intervention in this rebellion? What does his story tell us about race and power in early California?
   f. What have we learned about how different groups interacted with each other in early Los Angeles and California? Overall, how were indigenous people viewed and treated?

4. After discussing the video, place students into groups of 4. Students should have copies of Sources B-E as well as 5 copies of the “Historical Thinking Skills” graphic organizer (Handout 3).

5. Lead class in a modeling of the strategy: Sourcing, Context, Close Reading, and Corroboration with Source A using the graphic organizer (Handout 3). See the completed sample provided under Teacher Materials.

6. Check for understanding to see if students have any questions about Source A or the strategy.

7. Now that students are familiar with the strategies, assign or allow students to choose a “role” for analyzing Sources B-E with their group (each student is responsible for completing “Sourcing,” “Close Reading,” etc). By doing this, students will jigsaw the analysis of each source.

8. Give students about 4-5 minutes to read or examine the source on their own and take notes for their “role.”
9. Then, have students share out with each other within their groups of 4.

10. Once each student has shared, the group can discuss the source and complete the “Connection” portion, which helps students understand how the source helps answer the historical inquiry question.

11. Repeat for Sources C-E. Students can keep the same “role” or rotate each round. (Note: If conducting this lesson over two days, may need to pause in the middle of this source analysis and return to the process the following day)

12. After finishing the source analysis, consider bringing the class back together for a brief discussion. Some questions to consider:
   a. What does Toypurina’s story tell us about early California history?
   b. If Hackle’s account is accurate and Toypurina did not play a significant role in this rebellion, why do you think some groups regard her as a hero?
   c. Why do you think these different artists have made an effort to remember or memorialize Toypurina and local indigenous history?
   d. How would you remember Toypurina?

13. To assess student learning, have students choose two different remembrances of Toypurina from Sources A-E and compare and contrast these perspectives in an 8-sentence paragraph (Handout 6). Students need to explain both HOW these individuals or groups remember Toypurina and WHY they remember her this way. Also, students must identify and explain the similarities and differences between these two perspectives. See provided graphic organizer to help students organize their ideas and analysis (Handout 4), guidance and outline for the 8-sentence paragraph (Handout 5) before beginning to write the paragraph.
   a. Extension: As an additional activity and assessment of student learning, teachers can have students create their own memorial of Toypurina. Students should consider where this memorial would be located, the appearance of the memorial, and a plaque or inscription telling the story of Toypurina.

**Assessment**

Students will write an 8-sentence paragraph in which they choose two different perspectives or memories of Toypurina from either the video and/or the sources provided. Students will cite source-based evidence and identify both similarities and differences between the two perspectives.

Extension: As an additional activity and assessment of student learning, teachers can have students create their own memorial of Toypurina. Students should consider where this memorial would be located, the appearance of the memorial, and a plaque or inscription telling the story of Toypurina.
Bibliography


SOURCE A

Account of Toypurina’s involvement in the revolt, Thomas Workman Temple II, “Toypurina the Witch and the Indian Uprising at San Gabriel” 1931.


Thomas Workman Temple II was born in 1905 in San Diego to parents of mixed Anglo and Native American descent, but grew up near the Mission of San Gabriel and eventually became the official historian of the mission.

Deceived by an Indian sorceress [Toypurina] into believing that her powerful magic had already accounted for the padres, they came determined to kill the unsuspecting corporal and his soldiers of the guard. . . . Led by a renegade Indian neophyte who knew his way about the deep shadows of the empty court, the well-armed war party slipped on cat feet towards the sleeping quarters of the padres. . . . There, in the center of the bedroom were the prostrate forms of the two Franciscans, laid out for burial—"put into the long sleep"—just as the Indian witch had promised them.... Suddenly, the recumbent padres leaped to life [for their lifeless forms had been soldiers lying in wait]; wild shrieks rent the night air. Above this dreadful din there rang out the cry of "SANTIAGO!"—as armed soldiers appeared from nowhere. Scared out of their wits and taken completely by surprise, some ten of the dumb-founded [Indian] warriors, including their leaders, were captured in the wild scramble.

Definitions

sorceress: a witch
renegade: a person who deserts or betrays an organization or country
neophyte: new convert to the church
prostrate: laying down, stretched out, face forward
recumbent: lying down

HOOD is an acronym for Honoring our Origins, Ourselves, and our Dreams. The HOOD sisters is an all-female identified group in San Fernando Valley that uses public art to empower their community.
Judy Baca is a well-known Chicana muralist who was asked by the City of Baldwin Park to create artwork for a new metro station in 2005. Asked to produce work with a “mission” theme due to the proximity to the Mission of San Gabriel, Baca incorporated elements referencing local mission history, including a memorial to Toypurina.
DANZA INDIGENAS


THE STONE PRAYER MOUND, PLACED IN POSITION OF THE ALTAR IN THE MISSION SAN GABRIEL FLOOR PLAN, IS DEDICATED TO TOYPURINA, A YOUNG 23 YR. OLD GABRIELINO WHO LED A REVOLT AGAINST THIS MISSION IN 1785.

NATIVE LANGUAGE TEXT CAN BE FOUND THROUGHOUT THE PLATFORM WRITTEN IN FIRST PERSON AND ENDING IN THE LAST METATE WITH THE WORDS MEMORY AND WILLPOWER WHICH IS THE BASIS FOR PRESERVATION OF ANY CULTURE AND AN IMPORTANT TEACHING OF THE CHUMASH.

Close-up of plaque placed on stone prayer mound in front of the arch (seen in photo of plaza). Toypurina is mentioned in the 3rd and 4th paragraphs.
SOURCE D
Toypurina’s testimony as recorded by Jose Olivera (Spanish Sergeant) and Jose Maria Pico (Interpreter), “From Investigations of Occurrences at Mission San Gabriel,” 1785. Rose Marie Beebe and Robert M. Senkewicz, ed.

Question 1: Previously, when it was discovered that they (the Indians) were plotting to kill the Baja Californios as well as the priests and soldiers, had they not been warned by the Governor, the Lieutenant from San Diego, and by the very same priests that if they tried to commit a similar act they would be severely punished?

Reply: She responded that she knew nothing about that.

Question 2: After they had been warned and advised repeatedly to keep the peace, why did they come here armed to kill the priests and the soldiers who had harmed them?

Reply: She responded that it was true that she had ordered Chief Tomas Jaquichi to come and persuade the Christians to trust her and not the priests. She said that she advised him to do this because she was angry with the priests and all the others at the mission, because we were living on their land.

Question 3: What prompted them to come here, knowing that it would be impossible to kill the soldiers, for with one shot from the cannon many Indians would die?

Reply: She responded that the Indian Nicolas Jose had persuaded her by giving her some beads. She joined the others to encourage them to be brave and fight.

Question 4: Have they been harmed in any way at the hands of the soldiers, priests, or other Christians which would make them want to kill them?
Reply: She responded that the only harm she had experienced was that we were living on their land.
...there is a problem with Temple's account of the rebellion and investigation and with the veneration of Toypurina that it has generated. The majority of Temple's article consists of fabricated testimony, imagined details, and dramatic exaggerations. There was no "pale sliver of a new moon" that night. There were no soldiers masquerading as dead missionaries. No cries of "SANTIAGO!" pierced the evening calm....

...The rebellion's origins—and the individuals implicated in it—were more complex than those presented in Temple's melodrama, and what little can be glimpsed of these Indians' actions before and during the rebellion is suggestive of the complicated cross-currents of loyalties and tensions that characterized Indian life in Spanish California....

...All four of the suspects questioned, including Toypurina, identified Nicolás José, a thirty-seven-year-old mission Indian—not Toypurina—as the rebellion's prime instigator. Nicolás José, according to his testimony, was upset because neither the Franciscans nor the mission guard would allow him to have his dances or practice what the Spaniards termed "gentile abuses." When Nicolás José decided to rebel against the mission that he had helped to create, he contacted Toypurina, a twenty-five-year-old unbaptized woman from the village of Japchivit.

...Toypurina did not state that she participated in the attack because she hated "the padres and all of you, for living here on my native soil, for trespassing upon the land of my forefathers and despoiling our tribal domains" and that she wanted to "be done with you white invaders!" Rather, according to the soldier who recorded her words, she stated succinctly that "she was angry with the padres and with all of those of this Mission because we are living here in her land."
...Temple and later scholars have presented Toypurina’s words as a denunciation of the Franciscans and the soldiers for settling in Gabrielino territory, and that, it seems plausible, is part of what she said. But if we take Toypurina at her recorded word, she was angry not only with the Franciscans but with “all of those of this mission.” She was also angry, it seems possible, with "all of those" Indians who lived at Mission San Gabriel, not just with the padres and the soldiers who resided there.

...In the six years before the rebellion, the population of the mission had nearly doubled, increasing from 452 in 1780 to 843 in 1785. This increase in population coincided with a 50 percent increase of the mission’s agricultural production and a 300 percent increase in its livestock. In these six years, there were 714 Indians baptized at the mission, 569 gentiles, and 145 mission-born Indians. The increase in population at Mission San Gabriel, therefore, was the result not of the natural increase of those already at the mission, but rather of the recent relocation of more than 560 Indians from villages further and further from San Gabriel.

Perhaps now we can see who Toypurina referred to when she said she was angry "with all of those of this mission." She was probably referring to the hundreds of new Indian recruits at the mission, and in particular those from the coastal villages, not just the two missionaries and the four to six soldiers who protected the padres and guarded the mission. We can see the importance of Toypurina’s words when they are stripped of Temple’s embellishments and examined in the context of the rapid expansion of the mission and the historic tensions between Gabrielino villages. Toypurina’s testimony, therefore, not only underscores the Indian-Spanish tensions that plagued colonial California, but it reflects the Indian-Indian tensions that were exacerbated by Spanish colonization.

Definitions

veneration: great respect or admiration
fabricated: to invent, usually with the intent to falsify or fake
melodrama: sensational or overly-dramatic entertainment

Examine this Toypurina mural from Ramona Gardens, a community in East Los Angeles. What do you see? Who do you think the woman featured in the center might be? What makes you think this? What does she mean or represent to the community of Ramona Gardens? Why did the artist feature her in this mural?

Photo: Daniel Medina
1. What are some of the different ways the San Gabriel Mission is remembered by people today? How do the Tongva people view the mission?

2. Who was Nicolas Jose? Why did he organize the rebellion against the priests?

3. Why does Toypurina become remembered as the leader of the rebellion?

4. After the rebellion, Toypurina gets baptized and marries a Spanish soldier. How does this change the way we might remember Toypurina?

5. Who was Jose Maria Pico? How did he benefit from the intervention in this rebellion? What does his story tell us about race and power in early California?
## HANDOUT 3: HISTORICAL THINKING SKILLS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sourcing</strong>&lt;br&gt;Who wrote/created this? What is their point of view? Do you trust this source? Is it reliable?</td>
<td><strong>Context</strong>&lt;br&gt;When and where was this written/created? How might the circumstances in which the document was created affect its content?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Close Reading/Viewing</th>
<th>Corroboration</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Close Reading/Viewing</strong>&lt;br&gt;Summarize the document. What claims does the author make? What evidence does the author use to support their claims? What language or imagery is used?</td>
<td><strong>Corroboration</strong>&lt;br&gt;How does this compare to the other document? What other documents would you like to view to better understand the topic?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Connection:** How does this document help to answer the historical inquiry question?
Choose two different perspectives from Sources A-E. Compare and contrast how these sources depict the different ways in which Toypurina is remembered differently by different groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source _______</th>
<th>In this source, __________________________ remembers Toypurina as....</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>because...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source _______</th>
<th>In this source, __________________________ remembers Toypurina as....</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>because...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How are these perspectives of Toypurina similar?

How are these perspectives of Toypurina different?
This writing strategy can be used to support the writing of the “Assessment” portion of this lesson. There must be thorough commentary (explanation/analysis) of evidence that relates back to the main points or topic sentence of the whole paragraph.

Sentence 1
Thesis, Claim or Topic Sentence: State the two perspectives being compared, including how they are similar and how they are different.

Sentence 2
Evidence #1 (who is remembering Toypurina and in what way do they remember her?)

Sentence 3
Commentary (explains HOW and WHY Toypurina is remembered in this way by this group)

Sentence 4
Evidence #2 (who is remembering Toypurina and in what way do they remember her?)

Sentence 5
Commentary (explains HOW and WHY Toypurina is remembered in this way by this group)

Sentence 6
Commentary (explains the SIMILARITIES between the two perspectives)

Sentence 7
Commentary (explains the DIFFERENCES between the two perspectives)

Sentence 8
Closing Commentary (summarizes paragraph, restates topic or thesis sentence, and does not introduce new information.)
Choose two different perspectives from Sources A-E. Compare and contrast how these sources depict the different ways in which Toypurina is remembered differently by different groups.
**Source:** Account of Toypurina’s involvement in the revolt by Thomas Workman Temple II

**Sourcing**
Who wrote/created this? What is their point of view? Do you trust this source? Is it reliable?

Thomas Workman Temple II wrote this account. Since he was raised and grew up in the mission and then became the official historian, he may have a biased perspective of the missions or be trying to write the Spanish and the missions in a positive light.

**Context**
When and where was this written/created? How might the circumstances in which the document was created affect its content?

This was written in 1931, which was many years after the event, so there would not be any firsthand accounts of the event, making it less reliable. Temple was also a historian of the mission and would be trying to document the history of the mission in a favorable light.

**Close Reading/Viewing**
Summarize the document. What claims does the author make? What evidence does the author use to support their claims? What language or imagery is used?

In Temple’s account of the revolt, Toypurina leads traitorous natives into the rooms of the Padres. However, the Padres are aware of what is coming and ambush the natives with soldiers, catching them in the act. Temple’s account is dramatic and depicts Toypurina as a witch and other natives as violent traitors.

**Corroboration**
How does this compare to the other document? What other documents would you like to view to better understand the topic?

(Compared to “Borderlands” episode) This is different from the accounts in the “Borderlands” episode because it depicts Toypurina as a traitor and a witch, as well as a leader of the rebellion. In the video, the Tongva natives identify her as a hero and discount Temple’s account as inaccurate.

**Connection:** How does this document help to answer the historical inquiry question?

According to this source, it seems that some (especially non-native people) who lived in and around the San Gabriel mission viewed Toypurina as a native who was a traitor. Temple’s account may have spread myths about Toypurina being a witch or leading the rebellion, influencing many during this time to remember her this way.